



Report of the Evaluation of the project

‘Improving the Quality of Life of Adolescent Girls from Marginalised Communities in Koppal District, Karnataka’

Implemented by

**Karnataka Health Promotion Trust (KHPT)
Bengaluru, Karnataka. (Grantee)**

Evaluation Conducted by:

**Rajeev Ranjan Singh
New Delhi.**

**For
Azim Premji Philanthropic Initiatives Private Limited,
Bengaluru**

(November 2018).

Contents

List of Abbreviations	3
1.0 Description of the Project	4
2.0 Methodology and Processes of the Study	6
2.1 Methodology used for the study:	6
2.1.2 Examining of Financial, procurement, Assets, HR related Documents: ...	8
3.0 The Scope of the Evaluation Study	10
4.0 Findings and Observations of the Evaluation Study	14
4.2 Effectiveness	19
4.3 Efficiency	28
4.4 Impact.....	42
4.4.8 Key Takeaways:	46
4.5 Sustainability.....	46
4.5.6 Key takeaways:	48
During the Pre Project-Phase	48
The Perceived Empowerment, due to the Project	48
5.0 Conclusion and Recommendations	50

List of Abbreviations

AAA	ASHA AWS ANM
ANM	Auxiliary Nurse Midwife
APPI	Azim Premji Philanthropic Initiatives
ASHA	Accredited Social Health Activist
AWS	Anganwadi Workers
CDPO	Child Development Project Officer
CHC	Community Health Centre
CO	Community Organiser
CPC	Child Protection Committee
DC	Deputy Commissioner
FGD	Focussed Group Discussion
FO	Field Officer
GEN	General / Non-Backward Castes
GP	Gram Panchayat
Hb	Haemoglobin
IFA	Iron Folic Acid
KHPT	Karnataka Health Promotion Trust
MIS	Management Information System
MUS	Muslim
NPG	Non Program Girls
OBC	Other Backward Castes
PDO	Panchayat Development Officer
PG	Peer Girls
RCHO	Reproductive and Child Health Officer
RMAG	Role Model Adolescent Girls
SC	Scheduled Castes
ST	Scheduled Tribes
TT	Tetanus Toxoid

Evaluation of the Project ‘Improving the Quality of Life of Adolescent Girls from Marginalised Communities in Koppal District, Karnataka.’

1.0 Description of the Project¹

Koppal District is located in Karnataka, at about 300 Kms North of the State Capital, Bengaluru. In 2011, Koppal had a population of 1,389,920 of which male and female were 699,926 and 689,994 respectively. The district has a population density of 250 inhabitants per square kilometre. Its population growth rate over the decade 2001-2011 was 16.32%. Koppal has a sex ratio of 983 females for every 1000 males, and a literacy rate of 67.28%.

Koppal was carved out of Raichur District and came into existence in 1998. It consists of four taluks viz: Koppal, Gangavathi, Kushtagi & Yelburga. Koppal district is surrounded by Raichur district in the east, Gadag district in the West, Bagalkot district in the north, Bellary district in the south. Koppal district headquarters is closest to the world heritage site of Hampi. Though Koppal is not far from the mineral-rich regions of Hospet and Bellary, there is little industry in the district. It is predominantly a rural district with 83.19% of its inhabitants residing in rural areas. Main occupation in the region is agriculture. The religious breakup of the population is as follows: Hindu (87.63%), Muslim (11.64%), Christian (0.29%), Jain (0.21%), Sikh (0.02%) and Buddhist (0.01%).

Koppal District is a backward district of Karnataka. In fact, in terms of its composite development index, Koppal is ranked 25th out of the 30 districts of Karnataka. In the Gender Index, it has the 30th rank. The Child Development Index (measuring Health, Education and Nutrition) for Koppal is the second-lowest in the State, at 29th Rank. In terms of food security, Koppal stands at 28th Rank. The overall incidence of poverty (2011-12) in the district is 40.7 per cent and remains significantly higher than the state level (21 per cent).

The region’s high rates of poverty, unemployment, and illiteracy; ill-equipped and understaffed schools; feudal agrarian social structure; and pervasive gender discrimination discourage parents from enrolling girls in school and cause many girls to drop out from the school.

Many adolescent girls in Koppal district have heightened vulnerability and diminished quality of life. Important causative factors are that instead of being given a decent secondary education and an opportunity to participate in major decisions affecting their life, these girls are forced by structural factors, including poverty, schools that commonly lack one or more government-mandated facilities, patriarchal culture, and discriminatory gender norms and practices; to leave school for marriage or work.

Indian society is highly patriarchal in its values and beliefs and gender discrimination often starts before a child is born. Sons are usually preferred over daughters and this can disadvantage girls throughout their life. Although structural obstacles to educational disadvantage and disempower girls in many societies, adolescent girls from marginalized

¹ From: KHPT Project Documents.

families in Koppal district are exceptionally jeopardized due to their community's traditions of underage marriage. This situation is a problem as it deprives girls of their legal entitlement to education, violates their human rights and a number of Indian laws, and impedes India's efforts to realize the Millennium Development Goals.

It was in the above context that KHPT began the implementation of the Sphoorthi project to enhance girl's education, health and nutritional levels through intervention activities at multiple levels. The term 'Sphoorthi', translated from Kannada to English indicates 'motivation.' The name of their program was christened by the girls themselves. The idea was to act as positive role models for parents and the community at large.

It is expected that the girls thus empowered will be able to access their Health, Nutritional and Educational entitlements and act as catalysing forces to empower the community as a whole. The project is supported by APPI and the current phase ends on 30th November 2018. This document aims to trace the journey of achievements that the program had till date since inception. This is an evaluation study, and it is hoped that the document will give an insight into the work that has been done during the past three years, since the rollout of the program in the area. Keeping the achievements of the Program in mind, the document also hopes to articulate some key suggestions that may be useful to further improve program delivery in the region.

2.0 Methodology and Processes of the Study

The project has been in operation in the area since December 2015. This evaluation was done to understand the impact of the project and the role of the stakeholders in the empowerment of adolescent girls in the project area. The objective of this evaluation study was to understand the program intervention and its significance in terms of the following: -

2.0.1 Achievements of the Program: Whether the results against the goals that were set were in line with the results framework and whether the necessary impact was visible on the ground at different levels across the relevant stakeholders. The aim was also to understand the challenges that are being faced by the organization in implementing the Sphoorthi program.

2.0.2 Effectiveness of the Intervention: To understand if the intervention has been able to bring about a distinct change in the lives of the targeted role model girls. It was also pertinent to know if the changes that came about in the lives of the role model girls made an impact on the peer girls, with whom they were paired. To assess the impact of the empowerment of the adolescent girls on their families, community and others, with whom the role model adolescent girls interact on a regular basis. Understanding these would help to assess if the main objectives of the program were being met.

2.0.3 Way forward: To assess if the changes in the lives of the role model adolescent girls were of a significant nature. What would be the strategies and programmatic needs, that would need to be pursued to meet the expectations, that accrue from the status of being newly empowered? How would the gains continue to reach out to the peer girls and continuation of this cycle of empowerment?

2.1 Methodology used for the study:

It was important that the study be conducted in a way that the evaluator would have access to information from multiple sources and stakeholders. The objectivity and the adequacy of the information were considered to be crucial elements being taken into consideration. The following were the various components of the methodology followed for the study.

2.1.1 Research instruments and tools:

The study was conducted primarily using qualitative methods. Various aspects of the intervention were observed and inferences drawn. The approach was participatory, based on group as well as individual interactions, interviews and observations.

2.1.1.1 Group Interactions: Interactions were held with adolescent girls in their groups. The discussions centred around their experiences based on their association with the program as peer as well as role model girls, the levels of empowerment that they've achieved as a result of their participation in the various programs organised as part of the process, whether they have been able to improve the access to their entitlements in the area of health, nutrition in education as per the project design and objectives. The evaluator assessed whether there has been

a change in the lives of the role model girls and whether there had been a flow of information for change in the lives of the peer girls as a result of their involvement with the role model girls. the impact that the girls have been able to make at the community level and the various challenges that they are facing during the course of their empowerment process, facilitated by the Program.

Interactions were also held with adolescent boys and youth². The purpose of these interactions was to study the impact that the empowerment of girls, was happening on the lives of the boys. It was also to assess whether they were able to look at the process of empowerment of girls in a positive light, or whether they found this empowerment to be undesirable.

Group discussions were also held with the *Panchayat* members, community leaders, *Aanganwadi* workers, *Jagriti Samiti* Members. The purpose was to find out whether the empowerment of the girls was having a larger impact on the community and whether these girls were seen as role models for others in the community. It was also sought to study whether the program was perceived to be desirable by the group members and whether the role of the organization was seen in a positive or a negative light, by the members of the committee. Aspects of sustainability of the program was also discussed with the committee members.

2.1.1.2 Interviews with Individuals, Government Functionaries and Other Stakeholders: One to one interaction were held with government functionaries which included the DC of Koppal, Panchayat Development Officer, RCHO & FW Officer, headmaster, teachers and also, the members of the community. Interviews were held with a clear focus to assess what the government functionaries and other stakeholders felt about the program and about KHPT as an organization and its interventions in the area of empowerment of adolescent girls. Through the one on one interactions, it was gauged whether the purpose of the overall program was understood by the stakeholders in its intent, design and implementation. An exploration also happened into what were some of the possible ways to address the emergent needs that the process of empowerment of girls would lead to. This was in terms of additional expectations from the program by these girls.

2.1.1.3 Case Studies: Case study is a way of understanding depths of experiences and narratives at the individual level. The case study of a Community Organiser was taken as an illustration of the changes in the lives of the staff that is engaged with the adolescent girls on a day to day basis.

2.1.1.4 Role Plays: To better understand the impact of the program on the adolescent girls, the evaluator requested the girls to perform role-plays depicting the change in their lives as a result of their participation in the program over the last three years, using a comparative narrative of their situation before and post their engagement with the program.

The role-plays helped the evaluator understand the tasks that are undertaken during the programmatic engagement with the girls. It also helped in understanding the changes that the girls have gone through. The nuances of the changes that the girls have gone through were also adequately visible as a result of the role plays,

2 The boys/youth who were interviewed were brothers of the adolescent girls'/community members of the community to which the girls belonged to.

which were devised on the spot with the girls taking upon themselves, the task of developing the narratives on the spot.

2.1.1.5 Meeting with non-program girls: The evaluator had a meeting with a group of girls who are not part of the programmatic intervention. This interaction with two distinct cohorts of girls helped in contrasting the result of the program comparing the impact of the program on the girls who are part of the program v/s the girls who have not been involved with the program. The two cohorts otherwise had socio-economically contiguous parameters.

2.1.2 Examining of Financial, procurement, Assets, HR-related Documents:

Documents related to the project were observed. These included papers related to finance and procurement besides HR were seen at the head offices at Koppal as well as Bengaluru. Papers related to the complete procurement cycle of one high-value purchase were inspected at the head office. This included physical verification of the same and checking for the entry of the particular asset in the asset register. Appointment letters and the personnel file of one of the staff members chosen at random were carefully examined to assess whether the systems that are in place are being implemented in letter and spirit.

2.1.3 Sampling and Selection of Stakeholders and Others:

2.1.3.1 Sample and selection of Program Girls: To get an in-depth understanding of the experiences of adolescent girls with the program a representative sample was taken from the group of RMAGs and PGs. 118 girls participating in the Sphoorthi program were met with, during the evaluation visit. This is about 3.2% of the total number of program girls. As the program girls are enrolled in schools, they were not available during school hours for meetings. The girls who had not gone to school and those who could be met during the post-school hours / off days were contacted.

2.1.3.2 Selection of other stakeholders: To ensure adequacy of information and overcome the problem of lower than expected sample size, information was also sought and received from other stakeholders. As far as other stakeholders were concerned; the sample was based on their availability and willingness to participate in the evaluation process. Meetings could be held with most of the relevant players in this category, especially government representatives. Members from the boys' groups, Parents of adolescent girls, panchayat and community members were the prominent stakeholders with whom meetings were held.

2.1.3.3 Selection of Non-Program Girls: During one of the meetings at a school, program girls of a few classes were called outside to meet the evaluator during their free time. It was observed that the entire class had come out as those entire classes were free. The evaluator asked the girls whether they were all part of the program. To this they replied in the negative. The NGO asked the girls who were part of the Sphoorthi Program to fall out of the larger group and asked the rest of the girls to return to their classes. After they were segregated and Non-Program girls had begun walking back, the evaluator asked them to return and sit as a separate group. The meeting was held with

three groups of girls simultaneously, viz., RMAGs, PGs and Non-Program girls. The plan of calling back of the non-program for the meeting, by the evaluator was not disclosed in advance to the NGO. This was done to ensure objectivity in ensuring that non-program girls could be met without any dilution to the process of their selection.

3.0 The Scope of the Evaluation Study

To be able to study the outcomes and impact of the interventions, it was important to bear in mind that information would be needed from various stakeholders besides the adolescent girls themselves. The following were the stakeholders (including the adolescent girls, who regularly participate in the activities at the Resource Centers) who have an impact on the outcomes of the intervention. The evaluator engaged with them during the period of the study:

3.1 Adolescent Girls: Interaction with a total of 118 stakeholder girls was done during the evaluation visit.

Table - 1a

Names of Villages; Total Number and Social Profile of Role Model Girls Present for Interaction.							
Sr. No.	Name of Resource Centre/Panchayat	SC	ST	OBC	MUS	GEN	Total
1.	Mornahalli, Bettageri			9			9
2.	Budhgumpa, Budhgumpa		2	16			18
3.	Hosagondbal, Hosagondbal			12			12
4.	Hosahalli, Bahadurbandi			4			4
5.	Hyati, Bahadurbandi			1			1
6.	Bahadurbandi, Bahadurbandi			3			3
Total			2	45			47

Table - 1b

Names of Villages; Total Number and Social Profile of Peer Girls Present for Interaction.							
Sr. No.	Name of Resource Centre/Panchayat	SC	ST	OBC	MUS	GEN	Total
1.	Mornahalli, Bettageri			21			21
2.	Budhgumpa, Budhgumpa			8			8
3.	Hosagondbal, Hosagondbal			13			13
4.	Hyati, Bahadurbandi	1	6	7			14
5.	Bahadurbandi, Bahadurbandi		2	7			9
6.	B.Hosalli, Bahadurbandi			6			6
Total		1	8	62			71

Interacting with the girls gave an idea of the intervention in the region. It was possible to understand the nature of changes in the RM girls and the change that they were being able to influence the peer girls.

3.2 The Program Team at KHPT: The evaluator met the various members of the KHPT team who were working on the project. They were met in a larger group as well in

groups / as individuals as per the clustering of their roles. The purpose of the meeting was to get a deeper insight into the various aspects of the Sphoorthi Project. The evaluator also wanted to get an understanding regarding relevant social issues, individual aspirations, capacities of the team at individual levels as well as a program team, their orientation and motivation for the tasks that they are handling and challenges faced by them in doing the work that they are involved with. Besides the current scenario, these meetings also gave an insight into the future preparedness of the organization to handle emergent needs of the program co-synergistic with the empowerment of the girls that is happening due to the intervention.

3.2.1 The finance and administration teams at KHPT were also included in the interactions to evaluate the financial and operational aspects of the program implementation during the project implementation phase, issues if any and possible ways to further streamline processes if the same is needed.

3.2.2 Meeting with the CEO was instrumental in helping understand the larger picture of the organization, besides the dovetailing of the program with other projects of the organization, its rationale and synergetic strategies. It also helped in developing a better understanding of the sustainability plan for the Sphoorthi Project.

3.3 Government Functionaries: Meetings with Government functionaries were planned to facilitate getting an insight into how the programmatic interface with the government has panned out for convergence during the last three years of the program implementation phase. It was also intended to assess whether the intricacies of the program are understood by those departments/functionaries who are interacting with the program. The following table informs us about the stakeholders from the government with whom meetings were held as part of the evaluation exercise:

Table - 2

Government Level Stakeholders With Whom Meetings Were Held, Their Total Numbers, With Purpose of Interaction.			
S.No	Government Functionaries	Purpose of meeting	No.s met
1	Deputy Commissioner, Koppal District	To understand the larger role that the girls can play in the various Government-run schemes. Also, what are the ways that the gains of the program can be scaled up?	1
2	ANMs, Asha Workers, Aanganwadi Workers	Whether the adolescent girls are being able to access their health and educational entitlements, besides impacting role of the mentioned functionaries in the region.	2
3	Ex. Gram Panchayat Member	To understand his view regarding the role of the Sphoorthi program in empowering adolescent girls	1
4	Gram Panchayat Member	Impact of the Sphoorthi program on the community.	1

5	Police Patil	To understand his views about the program and its larger impact on the girls and in the area	1
6	RCHO & FW Officer	Whether the adolescent girls are being able to access their health and nutritional entitlements, besides impacting role of the health functionaries, if any, in the region.	1
7	Panchayat Development Officer	Whether the adolescent girls are being able to access their health entitlements, besides impacting role of the mentioned functionaries, if any, in the region. Also, the role that the PDO has played in enhancing the access to entitlements of the girls of the Sphoorthi Program.	1
Total Number of Government Functionaries Met.			8

3.4 Boys Group: The boys' group was another stakeholder group with whom interactions were undertaken as part of the evaluation process. It was important to know what was the cascading effect on the boys, as a result of their regular contact with the girls, in their homes, community and at school level. It is expected as part of the overall project goal, that there would be a positive effect on the boys as a result of their engendering that would happen due to the girls participating in the empowering adolescent girls project. **Total boys met: 12.**

3.5 Parents of the Adolescent Girls: The project has led to a change in the attitude of the parents as far as their girl children are concerned. This is an overall expectation of the project. What is this change? To understand this better, it was important to be meeting with the parents of the girls who are attending the project to get a first-hand idea about the changes that have happened within them as parents and as individuals in an overall conservative setup. **Total Parents Met: 24.**

3.6 Community Leaders: The leaders of the community are an important network for the program, fostering mechanisms of information exchange between the adolescent girls and the larger community. The community leaders are also part of the *Jagriti Samiti*, which helps in advocacy efforts for ensuring that the entitlements reach the girls. As the Community Leaders are decision-makers, and play an important role in various spheres of community life, and have impacted the avenues of change in the lives of the girls as well as families and communities, discussions and dialogues with them are important for the overall impact of the program. **Total Leaders met:12.**

3.7 Community Members: Random conversations in the project area with people living nearby to the centres were also conducted to understand what do people in general in the community feel about the project and its impact on the girls. It was important to have this engagement with the community to see if they were affected in any way due to the girls' involvement in the project.

3.8 Education Functionaries: To be able to interpret whether the impact of the program on the girls made them any different in outlook and approach compared to other students in school, it was important to meet the School Principals of the schools where the adolescent girls of the Sphoorthi program were enrolled. It

was also important to know the role of the principals and school administration in case they were doing anything to facilitate imparting education to the girls of the project. **Total College Functionaries met:4**

3.9 Non Program Adolescent Girls: These girls are attending schools but were not part of the program. It was an important learning experience to meet them, to understand the difference that the program is making to the girls who are part of the program. By interacting with the non-program girls, it was possible to understand the growth trajectories of these girls and have a comparison of this with the girls who are part of the program to understand the difference that the program has made to the lives of the girls who are part of the Sphoorthi project. **Total Non-Program Girls Met: 25**

4.0 Findings and Observations of the Evaluation Study

4.1 Relevance

The Sphoorthi Program of KHPT has been working towards empowering adolescent girls during the project tenure. Adolescent girls are an important constituency that APPI engages with. The relevance of the project can be gauged from the fact that there is an immense need of the intervention in the area, as per the various stakeholders. The lives of the girls who are the main beneficiaries is improving as planned in the project. An overarching change has been evident in the lives of the Role Model Adolescent Girls who are part of the Sphoorthi Project. Besides the girls themselves, it was also observed that as a cascading effect, the families and the communities were able to benefit from the empowering process that the girls are going through as part of their involvement in the groups. The peer girls have begun to demonstrate the changes due to their interaction with the RMAGs. The project has found relevance in an area that is socio-economically the most backward region of the State of Karnataka.

The changes that were observed were in the following domains of entitlements that are the primary focus of the Sphoorthi Program: -

4.1.1 Health:

4.1.1.1 Knowledge of Practices that Promote Good Health: Accessing health entitlements is an important component of the project. However, to be able to access the health entitlements the girls need to be aware of various aspects of preventing and promoting health. This is an area in which the project has been working on, and the girls have been getting the necessary inputs. During the course of the discussions with the girls, it was found that they displayed a fairly good knowledge of different health practices that lead to positive health. However, it was observed that the girls who were not part of the program, were also displaying good knowledge of health issues and promoting healthy practices.

4.1.1.2 Access to Sanitary Napkins and Iron Tablets: There is a clear improvement in the haemoglobin levels in girls. While prior to joining the project, like most of the girls in the region, the girls attending the program were also found to be anaemic. There has been a significant improvement in the haemoglobin levels as the girls have been accessing government supplies of iron tablets from the local health centres. Access to sanitary napkins has also increased. However, during the midline evaluation of the program, the utilisation of sanitary napkins from the Government program showed a decline. This was attributed to the low quality of the product that was available through the Govt. program. The access to sanitary napkins and IFA tablets appears to be handled well by the schools themselves. It appears that this aspect of increased usage of sanitary napkins by the girls may be an independent aspect not necessarily linked to the program. The girls

who were part of the non-program group, it was seen was also well aware of health issues and nutritious food.

4.1.1.3 Delayed Marriage: It was observed that many girls have delayed their marriage as a consequence of their participation in the program. Many girls reported that with the support of the groups and as a consequence of the knowledge they had been able to delay their marriages. Talking to the group of parents revealed that child marriages had stopped altogether in their particular villages.

4.1.2 Nutrition:

4.1.2.1 Knowledge about Nutrition: During the course of the interactions with the girls, it was evident that now they have a good idea about the nutritional values of food. Interacting with other family members to educate them about nutrition in an activity that girls of the Sphoorthi Program are engaging in these days. Post the evaluator's interaction with the parents, this fact got validated. Nutrition-related knowledge is another aspect that was not necessarily seen to be related to only the intervention of the program. The girls who are not part of the program also displayed a heightened awareness regarding nutrition.

4.1.2.2 Kitchen Gardens: The kitchen gardens were an interesting experiment and found to be of value in expanding the knowledge of nutrition as well as improving food security. However, the scale of implementing this component could have been significantly higher.

4.1.3 Education:

4.1.3.1 Mainstream Education: As far as education is concerned, now the girls are clearly more aware of the possibilities that would open up for them in case they would pursue education at Higher levels. The evaluator found many girls who have been increasingly taking advantage of the educational facilities in the region.

4.1.3.2 Remedial Education: The remedial education component has been one of the most crucial mainstays of the program. In fact, it was felt by the evaluator that as the program provided access to remedial education, the Sphoorthi program was a success in the area. Remedial education is very cost-intensive and clearly unaffordable and its provision to the girls as part of the program was crucial to the high level of acceptability of the program.

4.1.3.3 Continuity of Education: There are many girls who were seen to be pursuing their school and college despite multiple hurdles. Many girls who had dropped out of school have gone back to complete their studies. The evaluator discussed these girls with their teachers and headmasters, as to whether they are any different from others who were attending their same school or college. The feedback provided to the evaluator by the concerned headmasters was that girls coming from the project, are extremely focused on academics and they were

clear about the fact that if they complete their education, they will be better placed to be able to create a career for themselves and be self-reliant.

4.1.3.4 Support to Other Girls for Completion of Education: Not only their own education but education of other girls has been an area of support by the Sphoorthi girls.

4.1.3.5 Scientific Temper: The stress of the program on eradication of superstition and the development of scientific temper is an extremely appropriate step taken in the right direction. This is with reference to the project intervention in a region deeply steeped in superstition and exploitation of girls based on obscurest religious and cultural beliefs and traditions.

4.1.4 Other Areas of Relevance of the Project:

4.1.4.1 As far as gains from the project are concerned in the above areas of increased access to entitlements in the area of Health, Education and Nutrition, it was observed that there is a cascading effect on the larger community due to the positive impact of the programmatic intervention. Friends, boys, community members, school/college mates and others have also been seen to be impacted in the above domains. This fact was reiterated by other stakeholders.

4.1.4.2 Relevance of the Project in the Current Socio-Political-Geo Context: In terms of the relevance of the project, to the region as per the specific context, it is pertinent to note that there are not any other projects of this kind running in the region. The levels of empowerment, confidence, scientific outlook etc., that we see in the girls who are from the project is far greater than other girls of the region.

4.1.4.3 Talking to the Various Stakeholders, whether it is Government Officials, Panchayat Members, Parents of the Adolescent Girls, Education Professionals and Government Functionaries: there was an overwhelming support to the initiative and unanimity in the opinion that the project is a much-needed intervention in the area.

4.1.4.4 Regarding Strong Strategy and Roadmap for the Future Relevance of the Project: The organization is in the process of developing the same. While there are clear pointers that there are discussions and thought processes happening about what needs to be done to address the aspirations of the girls more work in the form of guided discussions need to be undertaken to further crystallize the plan of action.

4.1.5 Interactions with Non-Program Girls: To understand whether the program was being able to be relevant to the needs of the girls, it was important to understand the status of Non - Program girls in the area to get a comparative idea. Thus, a meeting with some Non-Program girls was organised. The girls selected were from the same school, geographical area as well as

socioeconomic background to maintain contiguity. The following were the observations: -

Table - 3

~ Non-Program Girls ~ Similarities and Differences in Awareness Levels (Compared to Sphoorthi Program Girls)		
Sr. No.	Similarities of awareness levels	Differences in awareness levels
1.	They were able to talk about opposing child marriage, during the discussions. They were quite aware of concepts such as gender equality, self-confidence, discrimination and nutrition.	The non-program girls did not appear to have a very good idea about democratic institutions and our governance mechanism.
2.	They could easily understand that girls should complete their schooling, to ensure an improved life and career.	The girls were relatively unclear about the way forward in seeking their career choices.
3.	They seemed to be aware of nutritious food as they know about vitamin D, vitamin A, carbohydrates, fat and what is the role of these in health.	Non - program girls seemed to be distinctly less confident compared to girls of the Sphoorthi program, especially when compared to the RMAGs.
4.	The aspirations of the non-program girls were seen to be police services, teachers' engineers, doctor.	Capacity at understanding complexities while analysing multi-layered social concepts was something that was far more visible in the RMAGs.
5.	Talking to non-program girls one could see that they had a fairly good idea of the various kinds of discrimination that adolescent girls face in life. These included caste, gender, physical attributes, poverty level, whether educated or illiterate discrimination due to different salaries.	
6.	In terms of rights, they had a really good idea of the right to practice a religion of choice, cultural freedom, participation, education, women's and children's rights, rights against oppression, and the freedom of speech.	

4.1.5.1 Other Important Observations During Interaction with the Non-Program Girls:

- Some of the girls mentioned that they had heard of rights due to their conversation with Sphoorthi girls.
- There were no major deviations seen in the girls who are not part of the program when compared to the girls who have to be part of the program. It was seen that they had a fairly good idea about rights, the kind of oppressive environment that exists in our society, the **need for good education, what constitutes healthy and nutritious food, the idea of self-determination**, besides having a very good idea of what are the available avenues for building a meaningful career.
- **Sources of learning for Non-Program Girls:** As far as the avenues for learning for non-program girls was concerned, they cited **their education, Self-learning methods, specific teachers in schools, especially the social science teachers** to be their sources of learning.
- It was especially interesting to observe the non-program girl talk about concepts related to **self-confidence, self-respect, gender discrimination, and nutrition**.
- There was a clearly understood **relationship between a good education (that would happen only if schooling could be completed) and an improved quality of life for an adolescent girl**.

4.1.6 Key Takeaways:

- The project is relevant as there is a need for the intervention. The Sphoorthi girls have, on the whole, shown an increase in empowerment levels.
- In terms of the social need, the area is backward and girls are not given independence to decide about even simple aspects of their lives. The project helps overcome this.
- Many of the changes that are seen in program girls are also visible in the non-program girls, thus making it clear that empowerment levels amongst the adolescent girls are also rising due to other catalysts in the area, such as improved educational inputs, exposure to the outside world and general improvement of nutrition levels.
- The project is addressing the need for empowering the girls to be able to independently take decisions.
- While there is an overall improvement in the empowerment and awareness levels of adolescent girls in the area, the girls exposed to the program have shown greater depth of knowledge and higher levels of confidence besides possession of more comprehensive soft skills.
- The community is desirous of the project. It also appears to be adequately involved in the same.

- Other stakeholders (including the Government) have also shown involvement to further the aims and objectives of the project. These also further their own objectives.
- Remedial education was possibly the most crucial reason for the acceptance of the program by the parents. While this may be a positive aspect of the program, the risk is that other aspects of empowerment of the girls may not be the desired change for parents of the girls, but due to remedial education being a critical felt need, it may possibly be actually masking out the possible low preference of other program goals. Remedial education is, in any case, a welcome input amongst any community that sends its children to school, owing to the social pressure of excelling in academic performance. A program that offsets the cost of remedial education inputs is in any case welcome and not much work needs to be done to promote the same.
- Eradication of superstition is a component of the program that is invaluable due to its need in an environment of cultural backwardness.

4.2 Effectiveness

Doing the tenure of the project, the organizations³ along with the concerned stakeholders have invested a lot in the Sphoorthi program. The results framework is a reflection tool, of the outcomes against planned activities that were developed to guide the effective implementation of the project.

4.2.1 The following are the key achievements of the program since its inception:

4.2.1.1 Development of Human Resources

KHPT has recruited 35 staff members for the Sphoorthi Project. They have been provided with the requisite orientation and training to enable them to operationalise this project of a complex nature. The following are the inputs that the team has received during the course of the project implementation since its implementation: -

Position	Sanctioned	Recruited
DPC	1	1
M&E officer	1	1
ALO	0	1
Field Officer	2	2
COs - Female	20	20
COs - Male	6	6
Office staff	4	4

- Program induction.
- Perspective building.
- ToT - Life skill education.
- ToT - Leadership and communication.
- ToT - Digital film making.
- ToT - Sexuality and relationship.
- Team Building
- Others
 - Household enumeration format
 - Role model identification

³ KHPT and APPI.

- RM group formation
- Reporting formats

The Team appears to be fairly well aware of the components of the Results Framework.

The Program Team mentioned that there is a major change in them, in terms of enhanced understanding of gender, social development, education, nutrition amongst others. They have felt significant positive changes in their own ability to negotiate, advocate and live better lives as a consequence of being part of the Sphoorthi Project.

4.2.1.2 Awareness and Behavioural Changes among Girls Regarding Health and Nutrition

- Awareness among girls about health and nutrition and adoption of necessary behavioural changes such as maintaining personal and menstrual hygiene, eating healthy food, identification and prompt treatment of cases of severe anaemia, Improved outreach (to girls from weaker sections) and access to services of Health Professionals (AWS, ASHA and ANM).
- Openness about stigmatized topics like menstruation and behavioural changes like maintenance of menstrual hygiene among the girls.

4.2.1.3 Improvement in Educational Status of Girls, and Involvement in Sports

- Re-enrolment of drop-out girls in school, and revival of their aspirations to study further.
- Regular attendance in school by those who used to be irregular and often on the verge of dropping out of the education system.
- Articulation of a slightly wider range of aspirations, which in most of the girls is to pursue some of the other profession/course of employment and become self-dependent.
- Access to remedial education to improve academic performance.
- 5 RMAGs have reached the State level in Kabaddi. There has been an overall increase in the acceptance of sports by the girls and their families.

4.2.1.4 Empowerment of Girls

- Visibility of the impact of the LSE sessions on the RM girls is there. There has been a transformation regarding gender attitudes.

- Leadership camps have impacted the RM girls in a positive manner. Inputs included crucial topics like health, safety, future planning. Self-awareness, problem-solving, decision making and negotiation skills. Through interactive group discussions, story sharing, presentations, role-playing, and movies, camp participants explored the challenges related to attending school, social awareness, assertion for rights etc.
- Majority of the RM girls communicate freely and have also become free from fear to a large extent. More so, related to fear of talking to authority figures.
- Development of leadership capabilities among RM girls has been of consistent value and as per the program plan. However, there has been a relatively lesser extent of the development of leadership in the peer girls, as the contact with the RMAGs has been lesser than desired.
- The Role Model Girls have developed a high level of self-esteem and they have learned to respond to the injustice meted out to themselves or to other adolescents. They are challenging patriarchal norms.
- Most girls have become aware of their entitlements. There are clear indications that the girls especially in leadership roles are making definitive efforts in accessing their entitlements.
- Girls have started developing a gendered perspective; many of them recognize the difference between natural differences and gender-based discrimination.
- RMAGs in leadership has been taking initiative for raising concerns of the collective with concerned authorities, for example taking up the issue of closure of hazardous open and disused bore wells.
- The analytical and decision-making capacity of the RM girls was found to be of a very high level.
- Many of the RM Girls were fairly well equipped to be able to make video documentation. They had learnt how to be able to take videos using tablets and then their work was being edited with the help of the program team.
- Levels of empowerment, as seen in PGs are relatively lower compared to the RMAGs. This can be attributed to the much lower levels of inputs that have gone into the development of these girls.
- The program has shown ambiguity in the area of intervention for Peer Girls. The program appears to be spread too lean in terms of the nature and scope of the interactions between RMAGs and PGs. Also, there is a lack of clarity in terms of the needs of the PGs and

how are these going to be supported in terms of intervention by the program team (handholding support). Whatever is the follow-up from the Program Team and RMAGs is planned is appearing to be too less compared to the needs of the PGs. It needs to be understood that disempowerment due to centuries of subjugation cannot be mitigated by simply one or two meetings/interactions per week.

4.2.1.5 Development of Theatre Groups and a Scientific Temper

- The concept of *Samvada* using participatory demonstrative theatre for positive social change was observed to be a very successful method in spreading knowledge for community empowerment and eradication of superstitious beliefs.
- Girls from diverse social, cultural background interact openly. Girls take on the role of positive role modelling, the fundamental aspect of the Sphoorthi program very seriously.

4.2.1.6 Development of Trust within Families and Communities

- The various *Samvadas* (dialogues) between Father - Daughters, Parents - Daughters, Boys - Girls have helped in creating channels for communication to foster a facilitative environment for the overall empowerment of the Role Model Adolescent Girls.
- Parents appreciate the Sphoorthi Program and many of them are willing to send their daughters even for residential trainings as well as participate in workshops themselves.
- Impact on the families has resulted in a change in the mindset of communities. This has resulted in tremendous support for the RMAGs in their empowerment process.

4.2.1.7 Positive Response from Gram Panchayats

- The RMAGs take up the issues of their villages to the Gram Panchayats. The GPs help in resolving the problems. An example cited was the problem of drainage in the village that was brought to the notice of the GP members by the RMAGs and the issue was taken up for Redressal. Two school issues, that of gate and drainage were resolved by the GPs.
- The help of GPs was sought to stop child marriages. 3 child marriages were prevented in this way.
- The RMAGs are seen in a positive light in the eyes of GP functionaries,

4.2.1.8 Recognition from the Government System

- There are clear indications of recognition flowing in for the program from the Government system.
- Key functionaries at the District and Block level⁴, in the areas of Health⁵ and District Administration⁶ have voiced their appreciation for the program and faith in its outcomes.
- They have talked about the RMAGs having the potential to become agents of change in the region and also in helping in furthering the welfare objectives of the Government system in the areas of Health, Nutrition, Education and Family Welfare.
- Government functionaries are being involved by the Organization and adolescent girls in various events and routine matters related to access of girls to their entitlements.

4.2.2 Adequacy of the Results Framework: While it appears that the Results Framework adequately reflects the engagement of the Sphoorthi Program with the RMAGs, it is not adequately articulate regarding the intervention with the PGs, who constitute the majority of the Adolescent Girls in the program.

4.2.3 Performance of the Sphoorthi Project Against the Results Framework: The Sphoorthi Project has been able to make progress in the area of Empowering Adolescent Girls. In many of the expectations that were listed under the output indicators, the performance has met most expectations while there were some that need to be addressed as per details in the following Table - 3.

Table - 4

Performance Against Output Indicators of the Result Framework.					
		Output Indicators as per RF		Performance at the End of Yr. 3	
1.	Adolescent Girls	40 role model groups formed	40	64	In some bigger villages, more than one group is formed depending on the number of RMAGs and peer girls in those villages
2.		8 - 10 role model girls in each group	640	640	As per target. Initially, it had risen to 676, as more girls were selected to ensure that even in the eventuality of drop out, the project target is met. Also, some girls who showed interest, though not part of the project, were allowed to be part of the program. The dropped-out girls still continue to be part of the program.

⁴ Panchayat Development Officer

⁵ RCHO, Koppal

⁶ District Commissioner

3.	640 adolescent role model girls (complete the participation in) group sessions	640	569	Out of the total, 676 girls who are part of role model groups could complete all the group sessions. Since most of the girls are in the school, and the Sphoorthi project team and it has utilized Saturday and Sunday for conducting group sessions. In some cases, some girls skip these group sessions since the girl's parents force them to go to the field for labour work. There are also few cases when girls miss the group sessions due to menstrual and health reasons. However, the girls who have not completed all sessions, have attended most of the sessions.
4.	640 adolescent role model girls attend the training (Leadership and communication training)	640	540	These residential trainings were conducted in Koppal and few RMAGs did not attend the training since their parents were not allowed. In some instances, few girls missed the training since they have gone to other places while the training was conducted during school vacation.
5.	640 adolescent role models participated in the exposure cum exchange program	640	558 girls in 15 batches	87% of the RMAGs have participated in the exposure program. Some girls could not go for exposure visit along with girls from their village due to health and other reasons. When these left out girls were again invited to participate in the next batch, they were not ready to be with girls who belong to other villages. Because of these reasons one or two girls were left out in each village.
6.	55% of the total adolescent role-model girls enrol and complete the tutorial classes (through previous experience)	352	451	When planning it was assumed that 50% of girls may require tuition support but later when an assessment was done, 561 girls expressed the need for tuition support. Accordingly, 561 girls were enrolled for tuition and 451 have completed 3 months' tuition support provided by the project. This is a very successful component, as it has a direct bearing on the academic performance of the girls.
7.	320 peer groups formed	320	284	As per the plan 640 RMAGs to form 320 groups of peer girls. So far only 284 groups of RMAGs have formed. In some groups, there are more than 2 role model girls and there are 40 such groups. Such arrangements were suggested in those villages where there are an odd number of role model girls. It was also seen that out of total 640 girls 68 role model girls were not available to form peer groups because of various reasons like moving out of the village for continuation of education, not ready to take up the work due to SSLC preparation and so on.
8.	10 - 15 peer girls in the groups	3600	2969	
9.	16640 (weekly one interaction with 320 groups) interactions by the outreach worker with the role-model groups	16640	14352	As per the earlier plan formation of peer groups by RMAGs with mentoring support from Outreach worker supposed to have started from June 2017. Various project activities commenced 6 months behind schedule due to initial assessment, baseline etc this activity has started in August 2017. Secondly, since 320 peer groups could not be formed, hence the number of interactions also have reduced. It can be explored if these can be completed in the project extension phase if possible.

10.		At least one mentoring visit per month by the outreach worker with the role-model groups	11876	8628	As per the earlier plan formation of peer groups by RMAGs with mentoring support from Outreach worker supposed to have started from June 2017. Various project activities commenced 6 months behind schedule due to initial assessment, baseline etc this activity has started in August 2017. Secondly, since 320 peer groups could not be formed, hence the number of visits also have reduced. It can be explored if these can be completed in the project extension phase if possible.
11.		640 role model girls trained in video production and dissemination	640	676	Along with the RMAGs, some peer girls also participated in the trainings conducted on video production. This training was conducted by Community Organizers in village level.
12.		12 videos on different themes by each of the groups (total produced)	384	273	Many videos were produced from the RMAG groups but the finalisation of the same was done only for a few based on its quality and message it conveys. 50% of produced videos are on the theme of gender. It can be explored if the balance can be finalised in the project extension phase.
13.		Number of videos disseminated		561	Every month one video in all the villages (51 village * 11 videos = 561).
14.		72 of girls in adolescent panchayats	64	8	Formed in 4 panchayats (2 girls for each panchayat). As suggested by GP remaining to be formed during Oct & Nov-2018 on the occasion of IGCD and Children's' Gram Sabha
15.	Community	1280 parents in the groups	1280	64 groups and 1352 parents	The total number of parents are 1331 and 21 girls have single parents (1352). (For total girls 676).
16.		1280 parents participate in the parents meeting	1280	1331	This includes the participation of parents in any of the parents meeting.
17.		1280 parents participate in exposure programs	640*	444 parents in 15 batch	The target was to include any one of the parents hence the target was 640 parents out of which 444 parents have taken part in the exposure program. Some of the girl's parents who are farmers, many among them could not attend the exposure because of harvesting work.
18.		200 community leaders participate in every samvada program. (200 samvadas of each type, out of which community samvadas are 200)	600	808	Currently, under project activities, 3 types of Samvada are being organized. They are Samvada with boys and girls, Samvada between Girls and their parents and Samvada with community leaders. For this activity, a number of community members also participated in Samvada with girls and their parents, as part of Samvada with community leaders. Parents are considered part of the community and hence that number is taken into consideration.

*At the onset of the program, there was not much clarity on this aspect, as this kind of work was not done before. It was not clear as to what would it be like to work with parents. As the program progressed, it became evident that it would be possible to involve just one parent out of the two per RMAG. Hence the target was reduced from 1280 to 640.

4.2.4 Whether there is a 'Model' Emerging: The use of the 'Role Model Approach' has clearly emerged as a Model from the Sphoorthi Project. The idea behind this is, 'if negative attitudes are demonstrated and they are followed, why not create positive role models at village level?' Use of positive role models is being tried out and tested in the project for empowerment of Adolescent girls. The involvement of the girls, parents and community members as part of positive role modelling followed by dialogue for change is the fundamental approach followed by the Sphoorthi Project.

4.2.5 Another Innovation for Changing Community Attitudes: Interactive Intimate Theatre, is an innovative way to address social challenges, aimed to build the capacities of the adolescent girls so that they address the social problems like gender discrimination, child marriage, anaemia, school drop out by engaging their parents and village members. The girls both peers and RMAG were trained for 8 days in the basics of Interactive Intimate theatre training. IIT (Interactive Intimate Theatre) is an innovative way to involve the audience in the play and get involved in discussions regarding the current norms and practices. The focus of the IIT training is to basically prepare the girls to involve the audience in the interaction through their play.

4.2.6 Whether Monitoring Data is used as a Feedback Loop: There are about 17 different kinds of data formats that are used to keep track of the various components of the program. These forms are filled on paper and sent to the respective FO after validation. This is then entered into the computer by the Data Operator. Comparative compiled data is sent back to the team members. 2 cluster meetings are held on a monthly basis. Data of micro-level is presented to the larger group and gaps even at the level of Adolescent Girls Groups get highlighted for further follow-up action.

The evaluator felt that while monitoring data was used as a feedback loop, but there could be pruning of data heads. A rethinking is needed to ensure that only necessary and relevant data is collected, as it appears that there is a data collection overload. This would relieve the team members and they would be able to spare more time on other core activities.

4.2.6.1 Monitoring of PGs: There was not enough monitoring of the PGs. While the RMAGs are monitored across various aspects of their growth in terms of attainments, nutrition status, the same was not done for the PGs. As the PGs are significant in terms of the program reach, it is important that the PGs were followed up adequately regarding their growth.

4.2.7 Meeting with the Panchayat Development Officer (PDO): -

1. The panchayat Development Officer felt positively towards the Sphoorthi program.

2. She has attended Parents meeting and *Samvada* programs.
3. During the meetings, issues such as lack of buses and transport are discussed. The girls were successful in resolving some of these issues.
4. Doing these meetings, the need for remedial classes were discussed. The panchayat Plus KHPT team pitched in for the remedial classes.
5. The panchayat Development Officer expressed extreme happiness at the fact that the girls were passing out of school and moving into colleges.

4.2.7.1 The PDO's Statements Regarding the Gains of the Program: -

- After attending the program, the support of parents to panchayat schemes and accessing services has improved.
- The adolescent girls are becoming aware of the 'various parts of the machinery' of the process of governance and the importance of Panchayats.
- Sphoorthi Program has intervened at the right age, and this is going to be of benefit to the girls for their entire lifetime.
- The problem of Eve teasing and transportation has been resolved to a certain extent for the girls. There has been an active engagement on this.
- Other colleges have started interacting with the Sphoorthi girls in their areas.

4.2.8 Delay in Implementation of the Programs as per RFA:

It was observed that there were delays in the implementation of certain components of the program. There was an overall delay of six months since the initial 6 months was spent on assessments like finalization of villages, enumeration of girls and family, complete baseline study etc. Due to these some of the program activities planned as per the RFA got delayed. Better planning of the project could have been instrumental in avoiding these delays. Possibly it would have helped if the planning and rollout components including the studies etc., were incorporated with adequate and appropriate time allocation to avoid the problems that caused the delays.

4.2.9 Key Takeaways:

- The project has been able to achieve many of the intended outputs.
- The participating girls and their families (mainly the RMAGs) besides the communities are being able to benefit from the project as there is empowerment of these girls that have been the key result.
- There have not been any major mid-course changes to the project. There should have been appropriate measures taken to ensure that meetings that could not be held were held. This would have ensured better program delivery.
- A Peer Learning model using positive role models in the community has emerged from the Sphoorthi Project. However, its implementation still needs to be better so that the overall model can be validated.

- The fact that the number of interactions of the outreach staff with the RMAGs could not be completed is a matter of concern. Also, the weekly mentoring meetings have not been completed in terms of the number of meetings. The reason given for the same is delay in the commencement of the project by 6 months. As these interactions are crucial platforms for the successful implementation of the program, it is recommended that these meetings be completed, in case the project is granted a no-cost extension phase.
- The interactive intimate theatre is an innovative concept and this could be naturalised and adapted to the needs of similar programs in other geographies.
- The monitoring data has been used to feedback into the program. It is an effective tool for ensuring that the project meets its objectives. There are many areas where pruning could be done to reduce the burden of data collection on the team so that they could focus more on their field roles.
- It was also seen that the monitoring data is not adequate regarding the development journeys of Peer Girls. The reasons provided by the organization for not doing so are inadequate. This needs to be corrected in case the project is extended, as PGs are the largest target group in the project.
- Officials in various important Government offices of the District that are concerned with the development of adolescent girls view the program with great positivity.
- Better planning, especially during the initial phase of the project could have helped ensure that there were lesser gaps in the program delivery. Aspects related to the preparatory tasks of putting the project on track needed much more thought in planning. This would have prevented in project delays and avoided the consequent underspending to a large extent.

4.3 Efficiency

The utilisation of the budget was discussed with the Finance Team and the Project Director (APPI Lead at KHPT). As there were unspent balances in the previous years the total budget has risen substantially due to the addition of the unspent balances of the previous project years.

A summary of the budget utilisation over the three years along with the relevant reasons, justifications as provided by the NGO are given in the Tables - 5 to 7. The evaluator's remarks are also given alongside. Table-8 has a total budget utilisation at the end of the project tenure.

Table - 5 Sphoorthi Project: Year-1 Budget V/s Expenditure (With Evaluators Remarks)							
Sr. No	Budget Line Items	Approved Budget	Actuals Expenditure	Unspent Balance	% of Utilisation	Justifications provided by the NGO	Evaluators Remarks
1.	Human Resources	36,12,000	38,99,867	- 2,87,867	108%	In year 1 some Senior person was recruited for the position of District Coordinator and salary was given Rs 60000/- against the approved budget of Rs 50000/-. Similarly, field-level community organisers salary was revised in order to fulfil the organization requirement of aligning with minimum wages act. Approval has been taken by PO for the same and clarifications were given in the narrative report of Year 1.	It is felt that the statutory requirements of the minimum wages act should have been borne in mind at the project design phase itself. This would have ensured a lesser budget overrun.
2.	Staff Training & Development	8,01,000	2,33,006	5,67,994	29%	The budget proposed for Attending workshops, meetings, Seminars, Conventions could not be spent since there was no opportunity came. Similarly, the budget allocated for micro-planning training could not be spent. Though there was provision of conducting induction training two times only one-time training was conducted. Since the training was organized locally training was completed with much lesser cost against the approved cost.	There has been gross underspending in this head. There appears to have been major mix planning in planning for staff training and development. While this budget head was fundamental to the successful implementation of the program, this remained underutilised.
3.	Office Administration Cost (Indicative)	31,62,000	24,28,118	7,33,882	77%	During initial six months the office administrative costs were shared with the MNCH project hence some of the budget's items like Photocopy & Stationery, Postage, telephone, fax & e-mail, Office overheads and maintenance, Electricity etc. could not be spent fully.	Administrative cost-sharing appears to have been inadequately planned, at the project planning stage.

4.	Travel & Related Expenses	6,42,000	5,12,220	1,29,780	80%	Since more time was spent on training and recruitment in the first 6 months there was less travel to field. Hence there was unspent in this budget head.	Recruitment was over in the first month itself. But time spent on training etc. led to lesser travel.
5.	Travel - Human Resources - Part-time	12,00,000	6,62,157	5,37,843	55%	There was budget provision made available for the senior technical persons visiting the project but in Year 1 there was not much scope to undertake field visits since the project was in the inception stage.	This aspect too appears to have been grossly over-budgeted. Planning of travel needs to be carefully planned at the project design stage, based on project need. In fact, evaluator feels that more travel of technical persons needs to be there during the initial project phase for better hand-holding.
6.	Audit, Evaluation & Monitoring	15,90,000	8,18,968	7,71,032	52%	Budget provision made for concurrent monitoring and documentation and dissemination could not be spent since the project was in the inception stage	Indicative of poor planning and execution of monitoring and evaluation processes.
7.	Program-Related Expenses	29,33,500	26,80,979	2,52,521	91%	Some of the training proposed in year 1 like video production training, communication and leadership training, remedial classes could not be spent. Budget provision made for developing the life skill education modules were not spent since the project has adopted the module from other adolescent girls' program implemented in Bijapur and Bagalkot districts.	Found to be on Track
8.	Outcome 5: Positive perception among parents and community	6,13,000	30,465	5,82,535	5%	Here major unspent was under budget item Monthly meeting with the parents and exposure visits. Since initial focus was more on girls' parents' meetings were not regularized in the villages hence allocated amount could not be spent.	Grossly mis-planned and poorly executed. The component of meetings with parents could have been used to strengthen the program with innovative and out of the box thinking.

	Gross Totals	1,45,53,500	1,12,65,780	32,87,720	77%		
--	---------------------	--------------------	--------------------	------------------	------------	--	--

Table - 6 Sphoorthi Project: Year-2 Budget V/s Expenditure (With Evaluators Remarks)								
S.No	Budget Line Items	Original Budget	Reapproved Budget⁷	Actuals Expenditure	Unspent Balance	% of Utilisation	Justifications provided by the NGO	Evaluators Remarks
1.	Human Resources	37,92,600	41,05,884	47,10,724	-6,04,840	115%	Since the community organisers (16 + 6 positions) salary got revised additional expenses were incurred.	Budget of this component was revised and approved to accommodate an increase in members of the field team. Despite the increase, there was a further budget overrun. This indicates inadequate planning while realigning budgets.
2.	Staff Training & Development	6,04,800	6,65,000	5,51,416	1,13,584	83%	The budget proposed for Attending workshops, meetings, Seminars, Conventions could not be spent fully.	The allocations were increased. However, the expenditure did not match even the original allocation. Poor planning, especially as it is in the second year when planning should have been better based on previous years' experience.
3.	Office Administration Cost (Indicative)	28,95,600	20,62,000	18,56,412	2,05,588	90%		An attempt was made to plan realistically based on previous years' experience. The situation was relatively better.

⁷ Budget of Year-II was reapproved by Janani Barath as per following Email: 'Date: Tue, 31 Jan 2017 09:34:33 +0000
Subject: Re: Sphoorthi - Year 2 revised budget - Seeking approval'

4.	Travel & Related Expenses	6,74,196	8,04,000	6,57,253	1,46,747	82%	Major unspent in the Director's travel cost. Since this position is partial and shared support during the year much travel cost was not incurred.	Reallocation was not needed. Had the original figure been maintained, it would have ensured better utilisation.
5.	Travel - Human Resources - Part-time	12,60,000	12,00,000	11,50,709	49,291	96%		Better planning has resulted in adequate delivery in this component.
6.	Audit, Evaluation & Monitoring	8,29,500	8,17,000	6,88,169	1,28,831	84%	Budget provision made for concurrent monitoring and documentation and dissemination could not be spent fully	Indicative of poor planning and execution of monitoring and evaluation processes.
7.	Program-Related Expenses	80,48,600	77,00,100	48,62,598	28,37,502	63%	Some of the new activities proposed like vocational classes on spoken English and computer education, theatre training for girls, developing mini projects by the girls, participatory community-based video production by role model girls, procurement of videos on adolescent issues, mentoring expenses by the role model girls for mentoring the peer girls could not be spent fully.	Major gaps in the accomplishment of program goals are seen. There is significant underspending in this crucial head, that encompasses most program components. Wide range of activities not taking place is indicative of the fact that there are serious lacunae in planning, implementation and supervision of the program.

8.	Outcome 5: Positive perception among parents and community	14,42,700	21,93,600	15,35,527	6,58,073	70%	major unspent is budget provision made for parents meeting to meet the expenses incurred for providing snacks and tea. Since these were locally organized project has not spent the amount on this. Similarly, the proposed sports event for the boys could not be held during the financial period.	The organization has not kept a record of the actual figures that have offset the costs (locally organised components). However, improvement was seen compared to the previous year. This head also indicates overbudgeting as original budget was closer to the actual amount spent under this head.
	Total	1,95,47,996	1,95,47,584	1,60,12,807	35,34,777	82%		

Table - 7 Sphoorthi Project: Year-3 Budget V/s Expenditure (With Evaluators Remarks)								
S.No	Budget Line Items	Original Budget	Reapproved Budget ⁸	Actuals Expenditure	Unspent Balance	% of Utilisation	Justifications provided by the NGO	Evaluators Remarks
1.	Human Resources	39,82,236	45,11,342	45,63,265	51,923	101%		Found to be on Track
2.	Staff Training & Development	6,35,041	7,34,000	1,84,814	5,49,186	25%	Major unspent was on budget allocated for Attending workshops, meetings, Seminars, Conventions. Since there was not much opportunity to attend outside the project this allocated money could not be spent.	This head reflects extremely poor planning. There was a need to proactively identify the training needs of the team and arrange training and utilise other forums for their capacity building.

⁸ Budget of Year-III Post realignment.

3.	Office Administration Cost (Indicative)	30,93,216	27,60,000	28,14,257	54,257	102%		Found to be on Track
4.	Travel & Related Expenses	7,07,964	8,05,200	5,80,225	2,24,975	72%	Major unspent was under budget provision made for travel of accounts and admin, field supervisors and field staff.	Lack of sufficient planning evident.
5.	Travel - Human Resources - Part-time	13,23,024	12,00,000	12,95,543	95,543	108%		Found to be on Track
6.	Audit, Evaluation & Monitoring	17,63,650	16,70,000	6,48,506	10,21,494	39%	Here budget provision is made for qualitative and quantitative end line surveys but this has been postponed and the amount allocated could not be spent. Similarly, the amount could not be spent fully under Documentation & Dissemination budget line item.	Amount likely to be utilised for the end line survey, to be conducted in April 2019 post conclusion of academic calendar of AGs.

7.	Program-Related Expenses	43,85,300	1,08,74,900	50,71,742	58,03,158	47%	<p>Some of the budget provisions made for meetings with role model girls could not be spent because at local level girls only sponsored the expenses in majority of the villages. Another unspent amount was the amount allocated for remedial classes. This is due to the timeline because this activity will happen only during the end of the academic year (Jan to March). Similarly, budget provision was made to conduct Girls event on the occasion of International Girl child day but due to postponement of this activity due to girls' exams in October amount allocated could be spent. Major unspent was regarding establishing the adolescent kiosks (Rs 19 lakhs). Project has tried its best to find out people who can establish this kiosk but finally, the project could not find out providers who can establish KIOSKs related to adolescent girls. Hence entire amount allocated gone as unspent.</p>	<p>Major gaps in the accomplishment of program goals are seen. There is significant underspending in this crucial head, that encompasses most program components. Wide range of activities not taking place is indicative of the fact that there are serious lacunae in planning, implementation and supervision of the program.</p>
----	--------------------------	-----------	-------------	-----------	-----------	-----	---	--

8.	Outcome 5: Positive perception among parents and community	2,77,704	4,35,621	1,03,944	3,31,677	24%	Amount allocated for Sphoorthi Family meet in villages could not be spent fully. This activity organized in few villages in year 3 and it created a feeling among the community that project is ending and henceforth field team members will not be coming to villages. For this reason, the field team suggested to withhold the activity to avoid community getting the perception of project closure. Some portion of the Amount allocated for parents meeting has also become unspent since parents have sponsored meeting expenses like snacks and tea.	The organization has not kept track of the actual figures that have offset the costs (parent/community sponsored snacks and tea). The interactions with the community needed to incorporate an exit strategy (sustainability planning), especially in the light of the fact that parents and community have shown serious interest in managing some critical components of the program at their level.
	Total	161,68,135	2,29,91,063	1,52,62,296	77,28,767	66%		

Table - 8 Sphoorthi Project: Total Budget V/s Expenditure Status as on 30 th November 2018					
S. No.	Budget Line Items	Total Approved Year - All 3 years Budget	Total expenses - All 3 years	Total Balance available all 3 years	% of spending overall in 3 years
1.	Human Resources	1,31,21,933	1,31,73,856	-51,923	100%
2.	Staff Training & Development	15,18,422	9,69,236	5,49,186	64%
3.	Office Administration Cost (Indicative)	70,44,530	70,98,786	-54,257	101%
4.	Travel & Related Expenses	19,74,673	17,49,698	2,24,975	89%
5.	Travel - Human Resources - Part-time	30,12,866	31,08,409	-95,543	103%
6.	Audit, Evaluation & Monitoring	31,77,137	21,55,643	10,21,494	68%
7.	Program-Related Expenses	1,84,18,477	1,26,15,319	58,03,158	68%
8.	Positive perception among parents and community	20,01,613	16,69,936	3,31,677	83%
	Total	5,02,69,650	4,25,40,883	77,28,767	85%

4.3.1 Analysis and Comments on Utilisation of Grants During the Three-Year Period:

1. The utilisation of the budgets is not satisfactory in various aspects of Programs. This includes Staff Trainings and Travel too.
2. It is expected that expenses on Audit, Evaluation, Monitoring and other related components will be incurred in the coming months, as some studies and evaluations are not yet completed.
3. There has been over budgeting for various components, which has been a major cause of the underspending.
4. The underutilised amount from the first year should not have been added to the program cycle of the subsequent years. It should have been adjusted against the yearly budget.
5. In some areas, it was found that the organization had taken corrective action the situation showed improvement.
6. Monitoring and supervision appear to have been given inadequate importance.
7. Careful thought was not given while re-aligning the budgets.
8. There were external reasons too for the underspending. These need to be understood in greater detail and the offset monetary value needs to be fixed.

4.3.2 Finance Related Procedures: As far as finance is concerned there is monthly planning, which happens with the Project Team. It is based on the activities to be done in the current month. A cash flow plan is made on the basis of that.

4.3.2.1 Purchases/Procurements: For any purchases to be made initially requisition is made, if the amount is above 20,000 Rupees. If it is a procurement, a market survey is done. 3 quotations are taken for the necessary purchase. There is a purchase committee which then goes ahead and gives approval for the purchase.

Procurement process is centralised. For Capital items, the managing trustee is also needed to give endorsement of the purchase. There have been no capital expenses under the APPI Sphoorthi Project.

To commence the procurement process, an indent is needed from the concerned department. The budget for the procurement is checked. Up to 20,000 rupees of purchase, no quotations are needed. However, for purchases above this amount three quotations are needed. For capital items, the procurement committee is definitely needed. the Managing Trustee also needs to be part of the procurement process in this case. Under APPI, no capital expenses have been there.

Observation: It was observed by the evaluator that there were only two quotations for a higher value purchase. It was told that the requirement was sent to 5 suppliers but only two responded. Considering that the purchases were related to Tablets (Electronic Tabs) and this was in the city of Bengaluru this was found to be objectionable by the evaluator.

- 4.3.2.2 Books of Accounts:** Regarding books of accounts, they are maintained as per Cost Category, project-wise and according to cost centres as per approval in the grant documents. The books of account are maintained on a daily basis. Tally account is maintained for Bank transactions. Monthly printouts are taken. There have been no deviations of significance, in the past 3 years. Most payments are made by Bank Transfer or by Cheque.
- 4.3.2.3 Asset Verification:** Assets are verified on a regular basis. However, it was observed that some of the assets of the project did not have asset tags affixed on them (projector and tabs).
- 4.3.2.4 Bank Reconciliation:** Bank reconciliation is done regularly. Bank reconciliation papers were examined and found to be compliant.
- 4.3.2.5 Signatories:** At the District Office in Koppal, there are three signatories. Cheques need at least two signatures. Cheques can be signed only after due approval from line manager. The Managing Trustee or Finance Director need to be there in all the Bank Accounts as one of the signatories. There are financial limits to the expenses at Zonal Offices.

4.3.3 Some Aspects Related to Administration:

- The Administration Department of KHPT provides support to the Sphoorthi program. The Department helps in the process of organising events selection of venues and accommodation.
- They help in the collection of staff attendance and consolidation of leave details and send it to the head office for preparation of salaries.
- At the time of joining, an induction is organised. Subsequently, trainings were held to build capacities in the program team.
- Post the recruitment phase, all new joiners are helped in the process of settling down in the organization. Accidental insurance, ID card and group Mediclaim is arranged for them.
- There is a sexual harassment policy in place. These policies along with the gender policies are discussed during induction.

- During induction the staff are explained in detail, the various policies including leave the various formats and Finance related aspects along with others.

Observation Regarding Sexual Harassment Redressal System: *The evaluator did not find the team to be aware of any system for Redressal of sexual harassment. There was no educational material, nor was there any circular on Sexual Harassment Redressal, that was seen to be pasted on the walls in the Koppal office. None of the outreach staff were about this aspect in the organization. This will need to be worked upon by the organization.*

4.3.4 Some Aspects Related to HR:

- Many of the HR functions are decentralized.
- Frontline workers are recruited at the local level.
- Payroll is processed at the Head office.
- Mediclaim coverage is available to the team.
- The limit for the same is 200000 rupees per employee and his or her family. There is an accidental Insurance of 500000 rupees per employee.
- Head Office works 5 days a week while the field officers work 6 days a week.
- The per diem and travel allowance is for all the staff, in case they need to travel for work.
- Maternity leave of 6 months is available for women and paternity leave of 8 days is provided for the male staff.
- Induction training is given in groups.

4.3.4.1 Recruitment Procedure: There is a recruitment procedure in place for the Organization. The HR Unit of the Organization manages the same. At the onset, the HR Unit is given the requisition for the post that needs to be filled. The HR Unit then floats an advertisement on the <http://www.devnetjobsindia.org> website for the indicated vacancy. Sometimes, an advertisement is also given in the local newspaper.

Upon receipt of applications and closure of the last day for accepting applications, there is a short-listing process based on scrutiny of applicants and their suitability for the concerned advertise position. An interview panel is setup. It consists of: -

- i) Operations Head.
- ii) Program Head.

For the Project Manager level and above, there is also an external member in the selection panel. If needed, there is also a subject expert. The expectation normally is that recruitment will take one month unless there is a notice period mandatory in the other

organization from where the selected candidate is going to be coming from.

4.3.4.2 Regarding Payments, Attendance, Provident Fund of Employees:

- All salary/honorarium payments to employees are done by bank Transfer.
- Advance payments are discouraged. If at all, very little advance is paid. There is a limit of 1500/- for the advance that is also treated as 'petty cash.'
- Cash payments are restricted to Rs.2000/-. But cash payments are rare.
- Provident Fund coverage is for all the project team, post the change in relevant laws in the State.
- Appointment letters have been issued to all the employees.
- Minimum wages are paid to ALL the staff.
- Attendance of all staff is marked at the project office.

4.3.4.3 **Regarding Decision Making:** The project director is responsible for Project related decisions, based on inputs from the project team. He consults the Chief Trustee, for matters meriting his attention for decisions which are more strategic in nature.

For team related administrative matters affecting day to day operations, the District Program Coordinator takes the decisions.

Donor agency communications are conducted mainly by the Program Director. The Program Coordinator is also involved in donor communications.

4.3.4.4 Regarding Appraisal

- There is a six-monthly review process for new recruits.
- There is a 1-year annual review as well. This is for all staff.
- Key result areas are discussed based on the project needs and learning this is for senior staff.
- The appraisal is first done as a self-appraisal by the team member. this is then followed up with an appraisal with the line manager
- Operation not linked to financial or any other rewards. It is only used for finding out what needs to be done to improve program delivery as well as for understanding training needs.

Observation: *it was mentioned that the HR and administration team at the central office visits the field. However, the evaluator feels that more visits are needed so as to ensure that the discrepancies which were found, for example not having asset tags on equipment, and the staff not knowing about sexual harassment Redressal mechanism, would have been reduced had there been more proactive visits by the HR and admin teams.*

4.3.5 Key Takeaways:

- As can be seen above, the reasons for expenditure not being as per the allocations has a mix of various factors. These are mainly due to less than efficient program management.
- Poor utilisation of amounts in some of the categories can be traced to reasons that were not foreseen and external in nature, such as lack of clarity in some of the work that needed to be done as well as communities contributing for the project. The latter was not quantified. Had that been done, it would help in developing a better understanding of the potential of a community in a project of this nature, for planning future interventions.
- Some things also could have been planned better and more proactively. The evaluator also feels that re-allocations of unspent balances could be dealt with in consultation with APPI, in a timelier manner for some categories for which it was clear that expenditure would not be as per the plans. This is especially true for last year's rollover funds.
- On the whole, it was found that the budget utilisation could have been far better than what it is at this juncture. This is an area that the organization needs to work upon.
- The organization has robust program management systems. Procurement, maintaining of account books, recruitments, maintaining of assets etc.
- However, discrepancies were found in asset tagging, lack of information regarding the sexual harassment policies and implementation of the processes in procurement. These need to be clearly addressed in future.
- The organization is led by a dynamic, experienced and dedicated team of professionals, who guide the program to achieve higher levels of performance. The average work experience of the frontline Community Organisers is 4.2 years.
- Supervision and monitoring of the program needs considerable strengthening.
- Funds that were unutilised needed to be adjusted against the subsequent year budgets, not added to the same.
- Capacity building/training of the team was a component that needed more attention. There were adequate resources allocated for the same. Attention to this aspect would have led to overall better program implementation.

4.4 Impact

The end line study of the program has not yet been conducted by the Organization. This is due to the fact that the academic cycle of the students will conclude in April 2019, and many of the program outcomes are linked to academic performance, which would be possible to gauge only post the completion of the academic calendar cycle.

4.4.1 Achievements:

Towards the conclusion of the approved project phase, it was observed that the project has met many of its objectives. Some of the achievements that were visible post-meeting with the sample of AGs and other stakeholders have been seen to be as follows: -

- 1) The girls have demonstrated an increase in their empowerment level and that they have been able to access their entitlements in the areas of health, education and nutrition services, as a result of their participation in the various activities at the resource centre.
- 2) The RMAGs have displayed a very high level of problem-solving skills as well as an aptitude of very high calibre for meticulous planning and execution of tasks. This goes to show that if the inputs are there and there is a facilitative environment, there is bound to be positive change in the lives of the girls.
- 3) It is also evident that the families of the adolescent girls as well as their communities have shown involvement in the activities of the resource centre and they have also participated in the process of empowerment of the girls.
- 4) The program is well known in the area. The DC, as well as other Government functionaries such as the PDO and RCHO, have indicated that the girls have highly benefitted by the program. Also, the program has helped these Departments in achieving some of its intended objectives.
- 5) The innovative aspects of the program such as theatre and dispelling superstitions have been particularly helpful for the program.
- 6) Video film making is an area that has helped the girls acquire a skill not easily available to many girls in the area. It has also helped boost their self-confidence.
- 7) The boys in the area, those who have been part of the program and its associated processes, have displayed an increased gender sensitivity.
- 8) There has been tremendous growth of the program team in terms of their own capacities.

4.4.2 Non Achievements:

Despite most of the activities showing encouraging results, some of the activities could not be conducted to satisfactory levels. Had these been done, the impact would have been even more significant. Some of these activities conducted at lesser satisfactory levels and consequently leading to lesser measure of impact are as follows / in the following areas: -

- 1) The kitchen garden is a good and innovative idea. It can have a significant impact on the nutrition levels of adolescent girls. However, it was not seen that many families have adopted the same / been able to take advantage of the same.

- 2) The peer learning process needs to be strengthened. As of now, the number of planned programmatic interactions between RMAG girls as well as peers is too lean in terms of bandwidth and needs to increase. This needs to be incorporated into the program design stage itself in case the program is to continue further.
- 3) The girls of the program appeared to display lesser than expected aspirations regarding career choices. Similar choices were observed, compared to non-program girls of the area.
- 4) Sports, especially seen as a career choice, seemed to be somewhere on the backburner.
- 5) The frontline staff did not display the aspirations of a significantly higher level for their own future. The evaluator feels that this has the potential to lead to complacency and can be disruptive to the growth of the program. The organization needs to look into this through the medium of workshops and further building of capacities of frontline staff.
- 6) Tracking of growth etc. happens mainly for the RMAGs. The PGs have only attendance tracked. This needs to change. The PGs' growth also needs to be clearly tracked across various parameters of confidence, decision making, education, health access etc., to make the program impact wider.

4.4.3 Remedial Classes. Boon or Bane?

Besides the above, the evaluator feels that the thrust on remedial education appears to be an important component, driving the program. As this facility primarily helps in academic improvement of the girls, it does find easy acceptance. The parents are highly supportive of the same. However, the importance of this program has the threat potential for other programs and inputs as it could give an illusion that there is success of other components, while this may not be true. It's always easy to find acceptance to academic support programs as it is directly linked with academic performance. We need to ask the questions, whether the overall Sphoorthi program would get the same acceptance from parents, in case this component was not there.

4.4.4 The Missing Minorities?

The program seems to be missing out the minorities, especially the Muslims, in terms of its reach. While 11.64% of the district population of Koppal is that of Muslims, adolescent girls from the Muslim communities appeared to be conspicuous by their absence. In fact, Koppal stands at 350th rank from amongst the 640 districts of the country in terms of the population of Muslims. The M&E team too did not appear to have clarity on the aspects related to the participation of Muslims and why are they not being included in the Program.

Even in the program team, there did not appear to be even a single member of the team who belonged to the Muslim community.

It is important to note that a very large chunk of Muslims in India is part of the marginalised sections of society. They are on the bottom of the ladder of social, educational and economic development. The situation is far worse for the girls and women of this community. Development initiatives targeted towards the marginalised sections need to be cognizant of this fact and ensure their participation, to ensure fairness in inclusion.

4.4.5 Uneven Levels of Attainment:

The participation of the RMAGs in the program and the outcomes as far as their being able to access their entitlements and attainments in their levels of empowerment are concerned was found to be satisfactory. However, it was felt that there were differences in the levels of attainment. There are myriad reasons for this to have happened. There is a need to study these and where ever it is possible, strategies are needed to ensure that all the girls participating in the program, are able to benefit from the program to the highest possible level.

4.4.6 Unintended Outcomes:

As the project got operationalised in Koppal, new and varied experiences welcomed the program team. Not every change that was happening as part of the program implementation process was part of the project design. Various changes at individual as well as community-level were not foreseen. However, this does not go to say that all the changes that were unintended were undesirable! In fact, some of these actually improved program delivery as well as impacted the overall change process. The following are some of the changes that were observed during the course of rolling out and implementation of the project:

- 4.4.6.1 Aspirations at Levels Different from what was Planned.** When the project was planned and when it was being executed during the initial days it was not envisaged that the girls would be able to make decisions with the currently displayed high levels of maturity and analysis.
- 4.4.6.2 Changes in Boys' Perspective.** It was not thought that the perspective of the boys would be changing to the degree that it has happened. In fact, it was thought that the boys would be a very difficult challenge to deal with.
- 4.4.6.3 Acceptance of the Program by the Community.** The fact that the community would take ownership of the program was not envisaged. In fact, it was felt that working with the community would be an uphill task, not easy to deal with in such a short period.
- 4.4.6.4 Raising of Issues Needing a Higher Degree of Handholding, Support and Planning.** Girls started talking of very different issues than what was planned at the project's inception. They started talking about governance issues such as lack of school transportation, provision of paved roads and other community issues. This meant that the program team needed to be equipped at a very different level to be able to help the girls explore Redressal and addressing these needs.
- 4.4.6.5 It was not Thought that Marriage would be an issue of Discourse.** It was not expected that marriage would be an issue that the adolescent girls at the RCs would be dealing with, in personal as well as community discussions. However, it came out to be one of the bigger issues that the girls wanted to address. Not only do the girls now look

forward to delaying their marriages, but a big chunk of the girls is in favour of choosing their own life partners. This possibly throws open a new challenge in the area of life skills education.

4.4.6.6 Cooperation from the State Government Authorities. Cooperation from the various Departments of the Government was expected, but not to the extent that is visible at this juncture. The program has made a mark at District level and is seen to be a role model for managing programs for adolescent girls. The District Commissioner said that the girls can be instrumental in various supervisory roles in the execution of various Government schemes. However, while this shows the faith the top administrative official of the District has on the program, it could expose the girls to personal risks at the hands of vested interests. Other Government officers such as the RCHO and the PDO etc., see that the RMAGs can be agents of change in their respective communities. These officials regularly participate in the programs organised as part of the Sphoorthi Program. Their participation further aids in boosting the confidence of the adolescent girls.

4.4.6.7 Improvement in Health Status. In some of the cases of adolescent girls, their improvement in health was of a far greater magnitude than envisaged.

4.4.6.8 Cultural Aspects. The positive role model effect on the community has been greater than envisaged. Also, the girls have used the Interactive intimate theatre and as this is a new concept, the engagement of the community has been outstanding. This too was not envisaged.

4.4.6.9 Video Film Making. This is a skill that has opened up newer avenues that are useful and potential of which were not so high some time ago. The girls those who have acquired the skill, have gained in terms of high confidence levels besides being prepared for a new emerging market needing this skill.

4.4.7 Irreversible Changes: The intervention of the Sphoorthi Program will have some changes that are not likely to reverse, in case the program comes to an end. During the discussions with the girls and other stakeholders, the following were cited as irreversible changes: -

4.4.7.1 The Levels of Empowerment that the girls have achieved is unlikely to reverse itself. In fact, it is expected that even if there are no further inputs provided, the levels of empowerment in most girls who have been part of the program will rise.

4.4.7.2 Changes to the lives of the Project Team as well as others who are part of the Sphoorthi program and those who are on a similar journey as the girls they reach out to will also be irreversible.

4.4.7.3 Expectations of the Community, from elected representatives as well as government functionaries who are involved in program delivery, will not reverse. The girls have demonstrated that entitlements can be

obtained, provided there is an appropriate as well as collective effort to do so.

4.4.8 Key Takeaways:

- Mapping of Outcomes as per the RFA could not be done as the end line report of the project is not yet ready. This would be prepared by the NGO only at the end of the academic cycle in the State.
- The program has been able to achieve quite a great deal in terms of a lasting impact on the participating adolescent girls as well as the communities from which they come. Other gains include gendering of boys, involvement of communities, testing of innovative practices such as interactive theatre and response from the Government machinery.
- Some efforts are however needed to further enhance the outcomes. These include further inclusion efforts, mainly related to marginalised minority communities, strengthening of the peer learning process and addressing the uneven levels of attainment in RMAGs themselves.
- There have been some unintended outcomes. However, these are not detrimental to the project. In fact, some of these have been helpful in achieving better project delivery. The organization will need to bear in mind the additional task at hand to deal with these.
- The unintended outcomes will further enhance the overall project objectives.
- Irreversible changes are there and these would mostly be helpful in the area of empowering the adolescent girls.

4.5 Sustainability

4.5.1 Donor Diversity:

KHPT has been working in the current Geographies and nearby areas, for many years. As a result of the work that they have been doing since the past few decades, significant changes can be observed in the lives of people that they have been working with. Due to a history of meaningful interventions in the area, there are various organizations who have been showing keen support to the projects of the organization. These organizations are as follows: -

- 1) The London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine
- 2) United States Agency for International Development (USAID)
- 3) ViiV Health Care UK Ltd.
- 4) The South African Medical Research Council
- 5) Global Alliance for Improved Nutrition

- 6) United States Agency for International Development (USAID)
- 7) CBCI Society for Medical Education
- 8) Business Social Responsibility (BSR)
- 9) Janssen India Johnson and Johnson Private Ltd
- 10) Janssen India Johnson and Johnson Private Ltd
- 11) Global Alliance for Improved Nutrition
- 12) Global Alliance for Improved Nutrition
- 13) India HIV/AIDS Alliance
- 14) Karnataka State Rural Livelihood Promotion Society (KSRLPS)
- 15) Indegene Life Systems Pvt Ltd
- 16) ELCA Cosmetics Pvt Ltd
- 17) Indian Council of Medical Research (ICMR)
- 18) LifeStyle International Ltd
- 19) Indian Council of Medical Research (ICMR)
- 20) India HIV/AIDS Alliance
- 21) The India Nutrition Initiative (TATA Trusts)

4.5.2 Measures Taken for Continuity of the Program:

The gains of the program are invaluable for the various stakeholders who are involved with the Sphoorthi Program. The need for sustaining the program has been felt and planning is in process as to how to ensure continued programmatic as well as budgetary support to the program.

4.5.3 At Community Level:

- They have decided to take the work of the group forward by forming A committee and registering it. they will be meeting regularly and have discussions as to how to take the process forward. they are already meeting once a month as part of the program.
- It was also felt that there are certain budgets available at the gram panchayat level and these can be leveraged for awareness generation Etc.
- The gram panchayat can also assist in the process of school admissions.
- In the case of prevention of child marriages, it was felt that the community and the panchayat functionaries can play a prominent role to prevent these.

4.5.4 Panchayat Development Officer Level:

- Panchayat Development Officer had felt that if the program is continued by KHPT it would be a real boon to the area. she felt that NGOs are in a better position to handle programs like this.

- She felt that there was a need to explore sponsorship that can be taken for the exposure trips to continue.
- Panchayat could also take the adolescent girls for exposure trip but the number of girls would be very less because they have a very limited budget for this kind of work.
- Subscription of some library books can continue at the expense of the panchayat Development Officer level.

4.5.5 Chief Trustee:

- The chief Trustee of KHPT expressed that the Organization would want to take the program to 1.2 lakh girls in Koppal. He talked about the role of children's panchayats and that children will be able to take their own issues to the panchayat through this modality.
- He talked about the Sneha clinic functioning and that this could be leveraged at a much bigger scale to provide the needed health-related services two adolescent girls.

4.5.6 Key Takeaways:

As far as the interventions that are in progress as part of the Sphoorthi Project are concerned, they are currently on the right track. However, looking at sustainability, the project is at a relatively nascent stage, though there are potential possibilities for continuation of certain initiatives at the behest of the community as well as the Government and Panchayat functionaries. Also, the organization has a diverse range of donors who are supporting its interventions in other thematic areas.

The nature of the Sphoorthi project demands that three years may not be an adequate time period to expect the sustainability of the project. The project will need to engage with the target groups and other stakeholders for at least a few more years before it can be expected that the program intervention will sustain without external support. However, to be able to do this, the Organization will need to address the program management and delivery level gaps that have been cited in the sections above.

Table - 9

The Status of Girls Empowerment, Before and After the Project, Based on the Feedback Provided by the Girls.	
During the Pre Project-Phase	The Perceived Empowerment, Due to the Project
The Girls did not venture out from their homes before they had begun participating in the project.	The situation had changed drastically and now the girls not only they go out of their homes but they also involve themselves in various outdoor activities.
The dresses that used to be worn used to be <i>Ghaghra</i> and shirt.	They are wearing various dresses as per their choice.

There was a serious reluctance to talk to anyone outside.	Confidence has developed to a great extent and the girls can and talk to different people depending on the need.
Girls education was perceived to be a burden for families.	It is much easier for them to convince their parents about the need to get educated.
Out of a sense of respect, the girls used to not speak to elders very easily.	The girls conveyed that they are able to speak to elders without feeling that they are being disrespectful.
Cricket was a game that was perceived to only to be played by boys.	The girls have been playing not only cricket but other outdoor games as well.
Poor confidence in school.	They are far more interactive in school and engage with the teaching-learning process.
Notions were there about professions such as the armed forces were only for males	The girls are questioning stereotypes in professional choices. They also believe that girls can drive heavy machinery.

5.0 Conclusion and Recommendations

The Organization along with APPI, the adolescent girls and concerned stakeholders have worked to ensure success to the Sphoorthi Program. The results are there for us to see. Today, the Sphoorthi program reaches out to 3609 adolescent girls belonging to marginalised communities with a program aimed at their empowerment. Not only are they benefiting as a result of the program, but also, we can see a change in empowerment levels of their entire communities as a result of the cascading effect of the Program. However, much of the gains of the programs were not attained due to instances of poor planning and less than efficient implementation. The program could have also achieved more, had issues been attended to, with effective troubleshooting and timely corrective actions.

5.1 Core Strengths of the Organization and Achievements of the Program:

- The organization, with its history of working in the region since 2003, has been engaged in programs for the cause of empowerment of marginalised communities.
- The organization has a dedicated team of professionals who have been working untiringly to make a change in the lives of the marginalised people in the region.
- The frontline program team of the Sphoorthi Project is mostly drawn from the same region and have a similar background as the Sphoorthi girls. This helps in better rapport building and program delivery.
- The organization is well recognised and has the support of key stakeholders in the Government sector, besides others who are instrumental in the process of social change.
- Support for the programs of the organization is available from various donors and program support institutions.
- KHPT is a learning as well as leading organization. There is an emphasis on mapping the capacity building needs of the team members. Post this, training and capacity building opportunities are made available to the team members.
- KHPT has various innovations that have been extensively used at the grassroots level.
- There is a focus on achieving and excelling in program delivery.
- The government holds KHPT in high esteem and perceive the organization to be an organization of choice for their partnerships.
- The government and other stakeholders feel that the program has been able to make a difference in the lives of the girls who are part of the same.
- There is a change for the better, as far as empowerment levels are concerned, observed in the Role Model Adolescent Girls to whom the program reached out.
- There is a change in the attitude of families and communities who have actively participated in the program.
- The Kitchen garden component holds promise to improve nutrition levels of adolescent girls, provided it is implemented more efficiently and with diligent planning.

5.2 Weaknesses of the Organization and Critical Gaps Observed in the Program:

- While team members (of the Sphoorthi program) appear motivated, they need to perceive, evolve and then articulate more clearly their personal aspirations. Having clarity about personal aspirations is a positive aspect and is pivotal to the growth of a productive team member.
- There appears to be a tendency to over budget for activities. The organization needs to be careful in its budgeting, ensuring that it is linked to clearly doable activities.
- Careful thought needs to be given to program planning processes, especially at the inception stages. Many activities that were part of the plan, could not be completed at the inception stages causing large underspent balances from the program budget.
- There appears to be a lot of room to improve efficiency in the delivery of the program. Burn rates need to be tracked more diligently and recasting of the unutilised budgets needs to be done in a timely manner.
- Unutilised/underutilised balances from other programs should preferably not be used for other projects.
- There appear to be many points of disconnection between the program team working at field level and the Organizational staff at the Head Office. The field staff needs more support in terms of understanding systems and following of the same. This was clearly visible in the case of non-awareness of the field staff about provisions related to the Internal Complaints Committee (ICC) its existence, role and responsibilities in the Organization.
- There were various design shortcomings at the level of the program itself. It was observed that the design of the components relevant to the RMAGs concerned had got attention; however, some vital component related to development of knowledge, skills, attitudes of the PGs was pivoted on assumptions and probabilities. More work is needed to be done to ensure that the processes are held together with more robust methodologies.
- While the organization has many systems and processes to help it efficiently run the programs, there need to be much more attention paid for adherence to the same.
- The program team needs to be socially more diverse. More team members belonging to the minority community in the team will further improve vibrancy and improve inclusion.
- In the project design stage itself, there were gaps that have caused weak links to be created in the overall program delivery. Main aspect of this stems from the fact that the RFA itself does not clearly articulate the nature and scope of the intervention with the Peer girls who constitute the majority of the Adolescent girls who are there in the program.
- The coverage of the program in terms of engagement with the Peer Girls appears to be too lean and woefully inadequate. Role modelling devoid of a clear and adequate direction and handholding support by the Program Team will not result in inadequacy of outcomes with regards to the empowerment of Peer Girls. In the opinion of the evaluator, there was a need for much more intensified a) Planning b) Interactions and engagement and c) Monitoring needed as far as the program delivery component of the PGs is concerned.

- The timeframe of effective interaction between RMAGs and PGs was barely over just a year. This needs to be at least 2 to 3 years, with adequate handholding support and qualitative monitoring by the Program Team for a meaningful transition of the PGs into empowered individuals.

5.3 Recommendations:

5.3.1 The Merits for the Intervention: The results of the program implementation have shown encouraging results as far as measurable outputs are concerned. The program has taken roots in the area and the process of empowerment of adolescent girls has started to make an impact, despite the challenges posed by a discouraging and patriarchal social structure. Involvement of the community in the program is visible and the Government stakeholders hold the program in high esteem. The project implementation team is committed and the Organization has the necessary presence and expertise for handling a project of this magnitude and complexities.

5.3.2 Demerits for Intervention: There were many gaps too that were observed in the program implementation process. The extent of underspending for the program implementation made the overall experience less than satisfactory. This underspending has resulted from gaps in program planning and implementation.

5.3.3 Whether Continuation of the Project is Recommended:

Yes, the evaluator feels that the project support process needs to move and evolve into its next tenure to be able to make a positive difference to the lives of underprivileged Adolescent Girls. However, there are certain prerequisites that the evaluator feels are necessary and need to be ensured and supported for efficient program management, in case the project support from APPI is to continue into the next phase. The affirmative recommendation is being recommended only in conditions of its being contemporaneous to the following prerequisites. These are being recommended for successful implementation of the program: -

5.3.3.1 Recommended Prerequisites:

- 1) Aspects related to the overall management of the program need sustained challenging and fine-tuning. **The monitoring of the program needs to be made more comprehensive, especially taking into account the evolving needs of the Peer Girls**, who are the huge majority in the program but are tracked in a very skeletal manner currently.

- 2) **The program needs to also improve and increase involvement and interactions with peer girls**, who currently benefit less from a very lean interactive phase with RMAGs and project staff. The evaluator feels that the current focussed outreach to RMAGs appears to be rather narrow and much more work handholding is needed to be done with the Peer Girls.
- 3) **The meetings and interactions, especially with communities and PGs** that were to be done during the current phase will need to be completed in the no-cost extension phase if any.
- 4) **A framework for better monitoring of the program** will need to be worked out. The monitoring of the adolescent girls (**especially the PGs will need to be on independent name wise for each girl basis.**) Each girl will need to be monitored on a quarterly basis and cohorts of girls falling in the lowest brackets of achievement of empowerment parameters, will especially need to focus upon and their upward mobility within the larger group will need to be programmatically ensured and monitored. This will be done for each of the girls who land up in the lowest brackets, each quarter. This monitoring data sharing will be done with concerned stakeholders.
- 5) **Program monitoring of the above** will need to have a mechanism, preferably for an external validation, on a quarterly basis.
- 6) **Training needs of staff**, including personal reflection sessions and visioning exercises etc., as per programmatic relevance will need to be conducted using the services of professionals in the field.
- 7) **The procurement, asset maintenance and other** statutory administrative, financial and HR processes will be diligently followed for the project.
- 8) **Grievance System (including sexual harassment redressal) for Program Staff as well as Sphoorthi girls** will need to have a better structure and operational framework.
- 9) **There will need to be a reworking of per capita cost** of program delivery, which appears to be on the higher side currently. It could be explored how to increase coverage over much larger geographies benefitting more adolescent girls at the same cost. (Reduction in per capita cost of program delivery).

- 10) **Psychosocial help, counselling help, career counselling and development of soft skills/life skills of AGs** will need to be adequately provisioned in the program.
- 11) **The program team of Sphoorthi needs to be more diverse** (inclusion of workers from the minority community.)
- 12) **The program needs to reach out also to communities inhabited by minority and marginalised communities.**
- 13) **More focus on vocational skills** needs to be explored as per the need of the adolescent girls.
- 14) **Participation of adolescent girls needs to be less uneven.**
We need to develop a deeper understanding as to why uneven participation is happening. Maybe there needs to be a separate tracking mechanism for girls showing lesser participation and strategies developed to improve their involvement. Possibly intensive inputs needed for them in smaller subgroups?
- 15) **The reach of the boys' program** needs to be strengthened.

~ 0 ~ ~ 0 ~ ~ 0 ~ ~ 0 ~ ~ 0 ~